

narração e a importância do opúsculo, com breves desenvolvimentos sobre: o meio eclesiástico siríaco daquela época; a aplicação pelo médico nestoriano da teoria hipocrática das compleições à teoria dos modos musicais; o vocabulário ligado à música, ao vinho e à culinária; os poemas báquicos (*ḥamriyyāt*) que entremeiam o texto; as citações gnómicas e evangélicas.

Esta última referência leva-nos a salientar o cunho cristão indelével da obra em apreço. Ao mesmo tempo que ambas as *maqāma*-s de Ibn Buṭlān ilustram o grau de integração dos cristãos da Mesopotâmia na cultura literária árabe da sua época, aspecto não cabalmente evidenciado até à sua descoberta e divulgação, elas revelam a naturalidade com a qual esses cristãos viviam a sua fé religiosa num meio ambiente alheio, por vezes hostil, a ela. Saliente-se, a este propósito, que o nosso médico e filósofo nestoriano redigiu um tratado sobre a eucaristia a pedido do famoso patriarca bizantino Miguel Cerulário (ed. G. Graf, in *Oriens Christianus* 35 [1938]).

Não é de estranhar que a versão francesa (muito pouco anotada!) seja excelente, pois que o segundo dos seus autores é um grande especialista tanto de textos médicos árabes como de literatura árabe cristã.

ADEL SIDARUS

Universidad de Évora – IICT, Lisboa

ŁAJTAR, Adam, *Catalogue of the Greek Inscriptions in the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum*, (I. Khartoum Greek). «Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta» 122 (Leuven – Paris – Dudley, Ma: Uitgeverij Peeters and Departement Oosterse Studies, 2003), 265 pp; 80 pl. ISBN: 90-429-1252-9

The study of Medieval Nubian Greek Epigraphy was initiated by F.Ll. Griffith during the first campaign for the salvation of the cultural heritage of Nubia due to the construction of the dam on the First Nile Cataract near Aswan [“The Nubian Texts of the Christian Period”, *Abhandlungen der Königlichen Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Jahrgang 1913, Phil.-hist. Classe*, Nr. 81, Berlin 1913; “Christian Documents from Nubia”, *Proceedings of the British Academy* 14, 1928, pp. 117-146]. Eminent scholars like G. Lefebvre [*Recueil des inscriptions grecques chrétiennes d’Égypte*, Le Caire 1907 (reprint: Chicago 1978)], C.M. Firth [“Catalogue of the Greek Gravestones of the Christian Period from Ginary, Cemetery 55”, in

*The Archaeological Survey of Nubia, Report for 1908-1909*, vol. I, Cairo 1912, Appendix II, pp. 45-50], H. Junker [“Die christlichen Grabsteine Nubiens”, *ZÄS* 60, 1925, pp. 111-148], J.W. Crowfoot [“Five Greek Inscriptions from Nubia”, *JEA* (XXIII), 1927, pp. 141-150], Ugo Monneret de Villard [*La Nubia medioevale*, vols. I-IV, Le Caire 1935-1937], T. Mina [*Inscriptions coptes et grecques de Nubie*, Le Caire 1942], M.F. Laming Macadam [in O.G.S. Crawford, *Castles and Churches in the Middle Nile Region* (=Sudan Antiquities Service Occasional Papers 2), Khartoum, 1953], J.W.B. Barns [in P.L. Shinnie, H.N. Chittick, *Ghazali. A Monastery in the Northern Sudan* (=Sudan Antiquities Service Occasional Papers 5), Khartoum 1961, pp. 69-94], J.F. Oats [“A Christian Inscription in Greek from Armenna in Nubia”, *JEA* XLIX (1963), pp. 161-171], M.G. Tibiletti Bruno [“Di alcune caratteristiche epigrafi funerary cristiane della Nubia”, *Istituto Lombardo, Rend. Lett.* 97, 1963, pp. 491-538; *Iscrizioni Nubiane*, Pavia 1964], S. Jakobielski [*Faras III: A History of the Bishopric of Pachoras on the Basis of Coptic Inscriptions*, Warszawa 1972], J. Kubińska [*Faras IV: Inscriptions grecques chrétiennes*, Warszawa 1974], M.Krause [“Die Formulare der christlichen Grabsteine Nubiens”, in E. Dinkler (ed.), *Nubia. Récentes Recherches. Actes du colloque nubologique international au Musée National de Varsovie, 19-23 Juin 1972*, Varsovie 1975, pp. 76-82], J.M. Plumley [“New Light on the Kingdom of Dotawo”, in *Études Nubiennes, Colloque de Chantilly, 2-6 juillet 1975* (=Bibliothèque d’Étude 77), Le Caire 1978, pp. 231-241; “Nubian Christian numerical cryptograms. Some elucidations”, in P. van Moorsel (ed.), *New Discoveries in Nubia* (=Egyptologische uitgaven 1), Leiden 1982, pp. 91-97] and T. Hägg [“Some Remarks on the Use of Greek in Nubia”, in J.M. Plumley (ed.), *Nubian Studies. Proceedings of the Symposium for Nubian Studies*, Warminster 1982, pp. 103-107; “Titles and Honorific Epithets in Nubian Greek Texts”, *Symb. Osl.* 65, 1990, pp. 147-177; “Greek Language in Christian Nubia”, *The Coptic Encyclopedia IV* (1991), pp. 1170-1174; “Greek in Upper Nubia: An Assessment of the New Material”, in *Actes de la VIIIe Conférence internationale des études nubiennes, Lille 11-17 Septembre 1994*, III. Études (=Cahiers de Recherches de l’Institut de Papyrologie et d’Égyptologie de Lille 17/III), Lille 1998, pp. 182-185], have greatly contributed to the understanding of the nature and the function of the Greek language in the Christian societies of Medieval Nubia.

Dr. Adam Łajtar of Warsaw University was the one who undertook the heavy task of re-examining and re-evaluating the old editions, as well as publishing all new finds, both from the Polish excavations at Old Dongola and of any possible possession around the world [“Two Greek Funerary Stelae from Polish Excavations in Old Dongola”, *Archéologie du Nil Moyen* 5, 1991, pp. 157-166; “A Greek Christian Inscription from Ginari, Lower Nubia”, *ZPE* 91, 1992, pp. 147-149; “Two Greek Inscriptions from Polish Excavations in Old Dongola in the Collection of the National Museum in Warsaw”, *Aegyptus* 71, 1992, pp. 111-143; “A Greek Christian Inscription from el-Chandaq, Nubia”, *ZPE* 94, 1992, pp. 217-220; “Bemerkungen zu einem christlichen Epitaph aus Nubien im Louvre”, *ZPE* 98, 1993, pp. 245-247; “Varia Nubica I-II”, *ZPE* 104, 1994, pp. 201-204; “Two Greek Inscriptions from Deir el-Naqlun”, *Nubica* III/1, 1994, pp. 265-274; “Three Christian Epitaphs in Greek from Reisner Excavations in the Area of Gebel Barkal (Northern Sudan), *Journal of Juristic Papyrology* 26, 1996, pp. 73-89; “Varia Nubica IV: Das älteste nubische Epitaph mit dem Gebet vom sogenannten Typus Euchologion Mega?”, *ZPE* 113, 1996, pp. 101-108; “Greek Funerary Inscriptions from Old Dongola: General Note”, *Oriens Christianus* 81, 1997, pp. 107-126; “The Epitaph of Iesusinkouda: Eparch of Nobadia (?), Domestikos of Faras and Nauarchos of the Nobadae, died AD 1102 (from the collection of the Sudan National Museum, Khartoum”, *Gdańsk Archaeological Museum African Reports* 1, 1998, pp. 73-80; “Terracotta Funerary Stele of the Monk Ioannes from Old Dongola”, in S. Jakobielski, P.O. Scholz (ed.), *Dongola-Studien. 35 Jahre polnischer Forschungen im Zentrum des makuritischen Reiches (=Bibliotheca nubica et aethiopica 7)*, Warszawa 2001, pp. 327-334; “Inscribed vessels from the Monastery of the Holy Trinity at Old Dongola”, in *ibid.*, pp. 335-355 (in collaboration with K. Pluskota)], and soon appeared justly as the specialist *par excellence* in the field of Medieval Nubian Greek Epigraphy.

The outcome of such dense and systematic work in a field of research with very few people involved and in a country with urgent needs for antiquities registration like Sudan, was logically the publication of a *Catalogue of the Greek Inscriptions in the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum*. The task is not an easy one, not only because never before had anybody attempted the cataloguing of such a great number of Nubian epigraphic finds with such a variety of provenances, but also due to the hardships involved into collecting this material from the

storerooms of the Khartoum museum, the possessions of which have not been fully recorded since its first organization under the supervision of the specialists working there during the 60's' Nubian campaign. Nevertheless, Dr. Łajtar – with the help of Professor Godlewski who bore the initial idea and promoted it to the Sudanese authorities – succeeded in this task.

Eight of the published inscriptions did not possess a museum number (nos. 4, 5, 18, 19, 79, 80, 81 & 82 of Łajtar's catalogue); one of these (no. 4), known from the excavation reports, could not be located in the museum's magazines and its publication is based on photos taken during the excavation. Another one (no. 18) is currently being used in the British Museum exhibition "Sudan Ancient Treasures", and in the catalogue of the exhibition [Derek Welsby & Julie Anderson (eds.), *Sudan Ancient Treasures*, British Museum Press, London 2004] the find appears with a new registration number (SNM, inv. 30149). The opening of a new state museum in the town of ad-Damer, south of the junction of the Atbara and the Nile River, has seen the loaning of the "Epitaph of Ġoasse, Son of Sentiko(l), Eparch of Nobadia and Khoiakīššil" (no. 18 of Łajtar's catalogue) to the new institution. Three more terracotta funerary stelae were found after Adam Łajtar had completed his catalogue and are kept in Khartoum. Two are already published and commented by the writer [Alexandros Tsakos, "Δύο Επιτύμβιες Στήλες στα Ελληνικά από τη Χριστιανική Νουβία", *GRAECO-ARABICA vol. IX-X*, Festschrift in Honour of V. Christides, Athens 2004, pp. 365-381; "Linguistic Notes on two Funerary Steles with the 'Euchologion Mega' type of Prayer for the Dead from Christian Nubia presented in the 9<sup>th</sup> International Congress on Graeco-Oriental and African Studies", *Collectanea Christiana Orientalia 1* (2004), pp. 287-292]. The third one will be included in a complete catalogue of all relative finds to be presented in due time.

The *Catalogue of the Greek Inscriptions in the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum* is very well organized:

1. The edition opens with two *sine qua non* prefaces:

- a. one by Hassan Hissein Idriss, the Director of the Sudan National Corporation of Antiquities and Museums and Włodzimierz Godlewski of the University of Warsaw and the Polish Centre of Mediterranean Archaeology, which refers to both the Catalogue of the Greek and the Catalogue of the Coptic Inscriptions for which Dr. Jacques van der Vliet is responsible (pp. VII-VIII),

- b. and another one by the editor explaining the history of the project and addressing his gratitude to the people who supported his work (pp. IX-X)
- 2. Then follows an alphabetical list of abbreviations (pp. XI-XIII)
- 3. The next eleven pages (pp. XV-XXV) contain an introductory General Note on the Greek Inscriptions in the Collection of the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum. There the catalogue is identified as “primarily the study of Christian Nubian funerary inscriptions”, and gives details concerning the provenance of the finds (presented from North to South), the material and form of support, the script, the language, the formulae used in the inscriptions and their method of dating. In general, this Introduction is the best existing manual for anybody dealing with medieval inscriptional material from the Sudan.
- 4. A Note on the Editorial Procedure (p. XXVII-XVIII) could never have been skipped in such a publication. The so-called Leiden-system has been used.
- 5. The catalogue of the 83 inscriptions covers the next 211 pages. Each one is presented in a quite typified way:
  - a. museum and field inventory numbers
  - b. conditions of discovery and relative references
  - c. description of support, dimensions, lettering, script
  - d. publications & references
  - e. (proposed) dating
  - f. transcript of text(s)
  - g. critical apparatus
  - h. editorial apparatus
  - i. translation
  - j. commentary

The length of the commentary depends on the state of preservation of each find. Some very small terracotta fragments do not exceed half a page, while some more interesting and lengthy tombstones cover as many as twelve pages (no. 18). In several cases the same context is recorded in different inscriptions and then only references to the analysis in the relevant find is given. The choice for this does not necessarily depend upon the sequence in the catalogue, but rather on the particular interest of each inscription. The plurality of the matters discussed by Dr. Łajtar allow the reader to appreciate the deep knowledge of the editor upon the scriptural and epigraphic

material from Nubia, Egypt, Western medieval Europe, the Byzantine Empire and the rest of the oriental Christian traditions.

6. An extensive bibliography is offered in pages 213-224
7. The indexes (pp. 227-258) of personal names, of the rulers and the members of their families, of the important secular office holders, of the bishops, of the biblical names as well as of the names of pagan gods (existing in the *Catalogue* due to the possession by the National Museum at Khartoum of two 'Axumite' stelae written in Greek, nos. 77 & 78), of the geographical names, of the names of churches and monasteries, of the elements of dating, of all (complete and fragmentary) Greek words, as well as of Old Nubian and Coptic words incorporated in the Greek inscriptions from the Museum in Khartoum, is a real treasure for the epigraphist and have already set the frame for a subsequent publication of all medieval inscripational material from the Sudan. The Index compartment of the *Catalogue* is completed with a very useful grammatical and syntactical index; these two offer one of the best insights to the actual use of Greek in Christian Nubia.
8. Then follow the tables of concordances between Łajtar's catalogue and the earlier publications (pp. 261-262), as well as with the inventory numbers of the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum (263-264).
9. A photographic credit (p. 265) precedes the Plates where only three out of the eighty three pieces are not presented: nos. 14, 55 & 78.
10. The publication concludes with all 122 titles of *Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta*

In general, the *Catalogue* is very well prepared and presented, although the publishers should have cared for a proof reading of the text where numerous linguistic mistakes can be observed. However, the value of Adam Łajtar's work for the studies of Nubian epigraphy does not depend upon such details, but rather on his accuracy in presenting the results of his epigraphic research.

This accuracy can be checked only for the stela no. 19 (Pl. XVIII), where it seems that Adam Łajtar has not remarked the color applied on the letters; also, in page 182 the monogram for the title *presbyter* is correctly identified as having an oblique stroke crossing the vertical stroke of P. It would be tempting to read this rather as a monogram for the title *archipresbyter*.

On a more theoretical level one could discuss some points that show contradicting opinions as to the use of the Greek language by the

medieval Nubians. Note, for example, that while in page 69, in the commentary on no. 12 it is stated that: “the *καί* – style was characteristic of discourses and oral pronouncements, but it is difficult to expect its influence in Nubia, where the language of everyday communication was Old Nubian and not Greek”, in page 94, in the commentary of no. 19, it is said: “*καί* at the beginning of a sentence is possible due to the influence exerted by oral communication”.

In any case, the purpose of such a Catalogue is to open up the dialogue on relevant matters and thus such remarks could never diminish the value of the work produced by Dr. Łajtar. His *Catalogue of the Greek Inscriptions in the Sudan National Museum at Khartoum* can only be compared with pioneer cataloguing attempts of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, and certainly compared to these, it is at least of equal quality with the best among them.

ALEXANDROS TSAKOS  
IGOAS (Athens, Greece)

LEROY, Jules, *Monks and Monasteries of the Near East*. Translated by Peter Collin (Piscataway, NJ: Gorgias Press, 2004), 208 pp + 1 mapa; 72 fotos b/n. ISBN: 1-59333-276-9.

Edición facsimile del célebre libro de gran estudioso francés del arte cristiano oriental, Jules Leroy, publicado originalmente en Londres en el año 1963 (George G. Harrap & Co. Ltd.) en el que se incluye el relato de sus dos años de viaje por tierras orientales a mediados del siglo XX, durante los cuales visitó casi todos los países de la zona a excepción de Armenia, dadas las especiales condiciones políticas del emdío, en aquellos años, bajo el poder de la Unión Soviética.

El relato de Leroy, a través de los monasterios de Oriente Medio, es un canto a la ausencia del factor tiempo, la calma y tranquilidad que se respira en aquellas tierras, pese a la presencia de los elementos característicos del progreso occidental. La paciencia, “una buena digestión” y la energía, según consejo del autor, son las herramientas necesarias en toda alforja de viajero que se precie para acometer un viaje de tales características.

El libro abre con un “Prefacio” (pp. 5-7) en el que Leroy esboza las líneas esenciales que describen los datos que integran la narración de los diversos hechos vividos por el autor a lo largo de su viaje y sus innumerables visitas a distintos lugares. Sigue un mapa de Oriente Medio (incluyendo Grecia, Turquía, las ex-repúblicas socialistas